

MINUTES
MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS
METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY

March 5, 2015

The Board of Directors of the Metropolitan Atlanta Rapid Transit Authority held a meeting on March 5, 2015 at 1:57 p.m. in the Board Room on the 6th Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

Board Members Present

Roberta Abdul-Salaam
Juanita Jones Abernathy
Robert L. Ashe III
Harold Buckley, Sr.
Frederick L. Daniels, Jr.
Jerry R. Griffin
Freda B. Hardage
Russell R. McMurry, P.E.*
Christopher Tomlinson*

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/CEO Keith T. Parker, AICP; C-Suite Team Members – Chief Operating Officer Richard Krisak, Chief of Staff Rukiya S. Eaddy, Chief Financial Officer Gordon Hutchinson, Chief Administrative Officer Edward Johnson, Chief Legal Counsel Elizabeth O'Neill; AGMs Robin Henry, Ming Hsi, Reginald Mason, Ryland McClendon and Donald Williams (Acting); Executive Director Ferdinand Risco; Sr. Directors Joseph Erves and Kevin Hurley; Directors Lyle Harris and Louise Jackson Williams; Managers Donna DeJesus and Janide Sidifall; Manager Executive Office Administration Tyrene Huff; Sr. Executive Administrator to MARTA Board Kellee McDaniel; Finance Administrative Analyst Tracy Kincaid. Others in attendance Davis Allen, Eugene Alphonse, Sharon Dunn, Mark Eatman, Nicholas Gowens, Tamara Hunte, Saba Long and Srinath Remala.

Also in attendance were Charles Pursley, Jr. of Pursley Friese Torgrimson, Betty Brewer, Jim Callaghan, Ashley Dorsey, Pat Giles, Alvatina Lee, Dwayne Lee, Sr., Carla McDonald, Melvina Patterson, Dexter Seaborn, Stanley Smalls, Queville Smith-Staff and Mikesha Walker of ATU Local 732; Claudia Bilotto; Jack Buckingham of MATC; Ray Carini; Greg Cook; Serena Dickerson; Jean Dobbs; Howard Franklin; Adam Floyd Fussler; Paul McLennan; Don Meriwether; Melvin Patterson; John Paulson, City of

* Christopher Tomlinson is Executive Director of Georgia Regional Transportation Authority (GRTA); Russell R. McMurry, P.E. is GDOT Commissioner, and is therefore non-voting members of the MARTA Board of Directors

Sandy Springs; Chioke Perry; Cass J. Richmond II; James Schmid; Paul Swicord; Felker Ward of Pinnacle Investment Advisors; Brenda Williams; Maceo Williams; Lafayette Woods; Fred Wulfing; Andrew Young of Clever Device.

* * *

Chairman Ashe acknowledged and welcomed City Councilman John Paulson.

Councilman Paulson stated he has been following the process and attending meetings for the past few years. He commended staff for listening to the citizens of North Fulton and Sandy Springs. He thanked staff for arranging bus tours and said he is looking forward to the next step – the extension of GA 400.

* * *

Briefing - Resolution Authorizing the Solicitation of Proposals for Sourcing Services for MARTA's Mobility (Paratransit) Operation, RFP P34324 – J. Erves

For a period of time MARTA has faced a number of challenges in the provision of Mobility operations:

1. Quality of Service – passengers are not receiving the level of service they should
2. Per trip cost is high and not in line with industry peers

The service is for individuals who cannot participate on the fixed route bus service completely or the rail service completely. It is intended to be a curb-to-curb service. The service is also designed for a shared-ride service. The service is designed to accommodate citizens in Fulton and DeKalb counties. The service is ¾ of mile on any side of fixed route service. On average Mobility provides 1,800 trips per day, although on Wednesdays, the Authority experiences an average of 2,000 trips per day

Challenges

- On-Time Performance (OTP) - MARTA is expected to provide OTP of 100%
- Mis-Trips - This does not mean MARTA is leaving customers without rides. There are occurrences when MARTA is outside of a window of time – this has to be counted as a mis-trip
- Trip Denials – if MARTA is unsuccessful in negotiating a trip for a passenger, it must be counted as a trip denial
- Phone Time With Customers – Customer Service should spend no more than 90 seconds on a call

Board Meeting

3/5/15

Page 3

Due to these issues, MARTA formed a task force to identify areas of concern:

- Employee availability
- Certifications
- Scheduling
- Travel Training
- Compensation

Parallel with Contract negotiations, management focused on certification and eligibility. All actions flow into travel training. Another parallel is employee action. MARTA wants employees to love to come to work. In the area of compensation, management sought to remove the lower two tiers of the pay scale for Mobility operators. This resulted in operators starting off at \$11.20 - \$12.50 per hour.

In-person interviews - by sitting with the customer, they will have an exact understanding of exactly what we offer under paratransit services.

Management heard the concerns of the collective bargaining unit regarding the outsourcing of the paratransit services. The Union provided an unsolicited proposal that focused on scheduling, service, recommendations and service improvements. Some of the initiatives were items management was already working on, but we continued conversations. More stringent attendance guidelines were introduced because there is still an opportunity to capture savings. The second piece was introducing a hybrid model. Important to note; even if the Authority moves forward with a procurement, it does not exempt or exclude the Union from participating in the bid process. There are several Unions that provide bids on procurements – they do so successfully and they do so annually. It is not an unknown process.

The hybrid model. This model protects jobs. The current Mobility operators will remain in place. It presents an opportunity for improving service to MARTA riders. On any day the number of trips will fluctuate. On days when we cannot accommodate the trip, we are afforded the opportunity of off-loading trips to a third party vendor that cannot refuse the trip, so that the customer can be accommodated. This is an action that does require agreement with the ATU.

The last option is outsourcing. This piece does not marry us to the execution of a procurement. It does allow us in parallel, while conversations are still taking place with the ATU, to remain on a path of corrective action.

* * *

Board Meeting

3/5/15

Page 4

Public Comment

Mr. Stanley Smalls. Welcomed the new MARTA Board members. MARTA management should ask the bus drivers for ideas on how to help because they know the system. MARTA runs buses with outdated software and some buses have 200,000 miles on them. MARTA is sending 2-3 buses to the same location. Drivers can do the work when given adequate tools. No one has actually invested in the drivers.

Ms. Alvatina Lee. An 8-year fixed route operator. When MARTA decided they wanted to run in Clayton County, I knocked on thousands of doors personally so that my husband, a MARTA disabled retiree could have service. I am concerned with the outsourcing of Mobility for my husband and the community. She agreed with Mr. Smalls, noting that operators are not provided with the proper tools to complete their jobs.

Ms. Mikesha Walker deferred her time to Mr. Callaghan.

Ms. Queville Smith-Starr deferred her time to Mr. Callaghan.

Ms. Ashley Dorsey deferred her time to Mr. Callaghan.

Mr. Dexter Seaborn deferred his time to Mr. Callaghan.

Ms. Jean Dobbs. Ms. Dobbs asked why her shopping cart couldn't be strapped down if there is only one passenger on Mobility as it is very hard to hold a shopping cart while the bus is moving. She suggested that the address be changed for *Ray's On The River*. *Ray's On The River* is in Sandy Springs. MARTA will get more passengers if the address is changed. She asked why she can't call the same day and be put on the bus like other riders. She asked why she has to pay \$4 to go across the parking lot to Kroger.

Ms. Carla McDonald deferred her time to Mr. Callaghan.

Mr. Lafayette Wood. Mr. Wood spoke on behalf of EDAAC which he said is being dismantled and reconstructed. The Director of DEO is excited about the new direction of EDAAC. Mr. Wood said he is not excited. MARTA is not utilizing what's available, i.e., if MARTA is reaching out to the community, MARTA should utilize the signs in the stations, when someone calls into Customer Service, the wait time can be utilized to communicate with the customer and the over-the-air system that was used for *Ride With Respect* could be another way to communicate. He said he does not understand why EDAAC is being dismantled.

Board Meeting

3/5/15

Page 5

Mr. Maceo Williams, Sr. Mr. Williams said in the past, he worked with Legislators under the Gold Dome and as recently as last year he worked with Friends of Clayton Transit. In fact, Friends of Clayton Transit has been in existence for eight (8) years. Clayton has been trying to get the system down there for quite a long time. In the future, MARTA should use people who worked on the campaign. They were there. They were there with you down on Smith Street. Another thing we talked about is outsourcing. Outsourcing is not good for the community. Community outreach is done by people who are dedicated to their community – whether it's DeKalb, Fulton or Clayton. He said in the future he would like to present a rendering he worked on for a new transit hub in the Forest Park area.

Mr. Paul McLennan. Lives in DeKalb County and is a retired member of ATU Local 732 and a member of Concerned Transit Riders for Equal Access. Last month, Ken Mitchell spoke to the Board about a meeting that was held between the Union, members of the Concerned Transit Riders for Equal Access and MARTA management. This was part of a week's long process of our trying to find a way to work together to solve the problems that we all agree exist. So I'm surprised after having had that meeting and after Ken reported to the Board, and he's not here today because the disability community is at the Capitol lobbying for disability issues. So, it was a surprise to see this on the Agenda when this process has not been given a chance to work. The disability community has a slogan: *Nothing About Us Without Us*. As brother Smalls said, to talk about what's going to happen without the input of people most affected does not make sense. There is no profit to be made by MARTA Mobility as it is a public institution. Privatization is driven by the need to make a profit. We see it in the schools with a drive towards charters; we see it in DeKalb County where people say we're going to give up on government and start our own cities, That's not the solution. The solution is to keep the family together to solve our problems internally and to give our process that we started a few weeks ago a chance to work.

Mr. Harry Floyd Taylor. The elevators remain filled with urine and I see no improvement. There should be an ordinance where restrooms must remain open as long as MARTA is open. They are closed most of the time. I have quite a few pieces of luggage that have been soaked with urine in the elevators. MARTA waste money for urine detectors instead of fixing the problem. It should be mandated by the Center for Disease Control, Fulton and DeKalb Health. It is essential that MARTA keep the restrooms open.

Mr. Don Meriwether. Sixty-one year old disabled person who relies on MARTA to go back and forth to Grady Hospital and many other places. Most trips are bus, train and second bus. With the wait time, most trips are two hours each way – most of which is standing. Restrooms need to be open, especially for people like me. MARTA must have a live

Board Meeting
3/5/15
Page 6

person on the customer service line for concerns or questions. That may include a gate agent at the station. Yesterday, the 27 bus had no route because of a gas leak - they had to re-route. This was not MARTA's fault, but there was no method to find out where to get that bus again. I was at Kroger Ansley, about 2/3 mile from the last northbound normal route stop. I had no way from 6pm to 9pm to find out if a bus was coming, where the bus was. You need to have customer service, gate agents and open restrooms the entire time the system is running. There is no other way.

Mr. Paul Swicord. I too, would like to see the restrooms open and better signage in the stations. I used to take MARTA three times a month to the airport, so I'm a little bit of a different user. It's getting so disgusting with the escalators being out of service, urine standing on the floor in the elevators, urine smell in my suitcase. Instead I pay more for Uber or taxi ride. I don't understand how MARTA can get away with closing restrooms whereas other facilities are dedicated by law to remain open.

Mr. Jim Callaghan. Welcomed MARTA's new Board members and thanked everyone on the Board for their service. He said he was speaking on behalf of the International Union in Washington D.C. and on behalf of Curtis Howard, President ATU 732. The Union never discussed competing for its own jobs. Nor was anything ever put in writing. He asked the Board to reconsider the vote today. MARTA staff is trying to put new rules into the contract that was approved by the MARTA Board. This is against the law. Secondly, if you issue an RFP, the Union is covered by Section 13c of the Federal Transportation law which gives the Union rights if MARTA hires a private company. Mr. Howard asked me to read an excerpt from a letter: "...more specifically, any employee currently staffing Mobility who is placed in a worse position with respect to his/her compensation as a result of the contracting out of Mobility, will be entitled to a monthly displacement allowance which covers differential between his/her current compensation; protective period up to six years." Mr. Callahan asked that this 13c language be included in the RFP. The Union is in favor of an RFP to privatize management of Mobility because it has failed in the past. MARTA is not keeping track of mechanical failure on the vans. MARTA has not spent budgeted funds on the vans. MARTA often sends two vans to the same address. MARTA is using eight-year old software. MARTA has been meeting with Chuck Half of Pittsburgh and have given him hundreds of documents. KPMG is a fraudulent company. A Google search turns up dozens of cases against KPMG. Per Mr. Howard, the Union is calling upon Mayor Reed to urge his three MARTA Board appointees to vote 'no' on this deal and to appoint a fact-finding committee to publish a fact-finding report in connection with the Mobility plan.

* * *

Board Meeting

3/5/15

Page 7

Minutes of the February 5, 2015 Meeting of the MARTA Board of Directors

On motion by Mr. Daniels seconded by Mr. Durrett, the minutes were approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 9* members present.

Planning and External Relations Committee Report

Mrs. Abernathy reported that the Planning and External Relations Committee met on February 5, 2015 and approved the following resolutions:

- a. Resolution Authorizing the Award of a Contract for MARTA's Mystery Customer Program, RFP P 34580
- b. Resolution to Adopt the Locally Preferred Alternative for the Georgia 400 Transit Initiative (Connect 400)

On motion by Mrs. Abernathy seconded by Mr. Buckley, the resolutions were unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 9* members present. A copy of the resolutions, **AS APPROVED, ARE ATTACHED TO AND MADE PART OF THE OFFICIAL RECORD COPY OF THESE MINUTES.**

The Committee received the following briefings:

- a) Routine Excellence
- b) Media Monitoring F& 15 1st and 2nd Quarters

Audit Committee Report

Mr. Buckley reported that the Audit Committee met on February 12, 2015 and received the following briefings:

- a) Audit Activities
- b) Other Matters
 - Information Technology Top-Down Audit
 - APTA Information Technology Audit
 - Current and Future Initiatives
- c) Cherry Beaker – Year End Financial Audit
- d) External Audits - Discussion

Resolution Authorizing the Solicitation of Proposals for Sourcing Service for MARTA's Mobility (Paratransit) Operation, RFP 34324

On motion by Mr. Daniels seconded by Mr. Buckley, the resolution was approved by a vote of 6 to 1, with 9* members present. A copy of the resolution, **AS APPROVED, IS ATTACHED TO AND MADE PART OF THE OFFICIAL RECORD COPY OF THESE MINUTES.**

Mrs. Abdul-Salaam voted no.

Resolution Authorizing the Rejection of all Proposals Received for the Procurement of MARTA HR/Payroll Services Optimization, RFP P31773

On motion by Mr. Buckley seconded by Mrs. Abernathy, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 9* members present. A copy of the resolution, **AS APPROVED, IS ATTACHED TO AND MADE PART OF THE OFFICIAL RECORD COPY OF THESE MINUTES.**

Resolution Authorizing the Issuance, Sale, Execution and Delivery of Refunding Series 2016A - \$95 Million

On motion by Mr. Buckley seconded by Mr. Daniels, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 9* members present. A copy of the resolution, **AS APPROVED, IS ATTACHED TO AND MADE PART OF THE OFFICIAL RECORD COPY OF THESE MINUTES.**

Adjournment

The meeting of the MARTA Board of Directors adjourned at 3:08 p.m.